INTRODUCTION TO TAX TREATIES

PRESENTATION BY RAHUL CHARKHA
July 29, 2019
1. Double taxation
2. Double taxation relief
3. Tax treaty
4. Purpose of tax treaties
5. Tax treaty vs domestic law
6. Model Conventions
7. Structure of a tax treaty
8. Interpretation of a tax treaty
9. Applying the tax treaties
10. Evolving treaty landscape
DOUBLE TAXATION
DOUBLE TAXATION

- Same income taxed in two (or more) countries because of residence, PE, etc.
- Income taxed more than once (e.g. parent and subsidiary)

Juridical double tax

Economic double tax
DOUBLE TAXATION RELIEF
DOUBLE TAXATION RELIEF

Unilateral relief

Domestic laws of one country e.g. Section 91 of (Indian) Income-tax Act, 1961

Bilateral relief

Double Taxation Avoidance Agreement

Elimination of double taxation imperative for fostering cross border transactions
TAX TREATIES – WHAT ARE THESE?
In International law, treaty means a contract between two states.

International tax law refers to:
- rules that deal with tax conflicts
- involving cross border transactions, and is
- derived primarily from public international law
TAX TREATIES

What is International law?

- Body of law that governs legal relations between / amongst sovereign states or nations
- Rules and principles of general application dealing with the conduct of states and of international organizations with their relations *inter se*

Is international law really a law?

- Why do states comply with international law?
- 3 R’s compliance principle – Reputation, Reciprocity and Retaliation
Vienna Convention on law of treaties (VCLT) 1969 defines a Treaty as an international agreement concluded between States in written form and governed by international law, whether embodied in a single instrument and whatever its particular designation

Provide certainty as to when and how tax is to be imposed in a country where:

- Income-producing activity is conducted (i.e. source country), or
- Payment is made by one country to another

Main aim: to avoid double taxation; relief from double taxation

OECD BEPS AP6: Preamble of tax treaties to be updated to contain instances of ‘double non-taxation’ as well [ARTICLE 6(1) of MLI]
TAX TREATIES

Purpose:
- Allocation of taxing rights
- Allow sharing of taxing rights between two countries on a fair basis
- Eliminating double taxation
- Mitigate instances of non-taxation, or reduced taxation through tax evasion or avoidance
- Spur economic ties and development – tax sparing relief
TAX TREATY VS DOMESTIC LAW
TAX TREATY vs DOMESTIC LAW

🔹 Treaty – a formal agreement between two or more states

🔹 Question arises – which takes precedence? Treaty or domestic law?
   - this may depend on the country’s view on international law

🔹 Most countries – treaty precedes domestic law - this would generally require a provision in the domestic legislation

🔹 Some countries (e.g. US): treaty equals domestic law
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tax Treaty</th>
<th>Domestic Law</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agreement between two States</td>
<td>Act of Legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Involves negotiation process</td>
<td>No negotiation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relief from double tax</td>
<td>Charge of tax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing of tax revenue</td>
<td>Earning of tax revenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No frequent amendments</td>
<td>Frequent amendments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International law</td>
<td>National Legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dispute settled by appellate forum / Court / Competent Authority</td>
<td>Dispute settled by appellate forum / Court</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MODEL CONVENTIONS

- CIAT Model
- ASEAN Model
- National models (e.g. USA and Netherlands)
OECD MODEL

- Established in 1961 with developed countries as its members
- Essentially a model treaty between two developed nations with comparable tax systems and tax objectives
- Advocates residence principle and lays emphasis on the right of state of residence to tax
- Also addresses right of source country
UN MODEL

- Tax treaties between countries with unequal economic status:
  - Developed and developing countries, or
  - Between developing countries

- Drafted in 1980, designed to encourage flow of investments from the developed to developing countries

- Compromise between source principle and residence principle

- Gives more weightage to source principle – i.e. income should be taxed where it arises
THE ISSUE IN PRACTICE

To what extent can the Commentary on the OECD Model tax Convention on Income and on capital be used to give an interpretation of tax treaties?

Is the Commentary part of ‘context’ of Article 3(2)?
OECD MODEL

What does the OECD Commentary say about itself?

- "Commentaries … are of special importance in the development of international fiscal law"

- "not designed to be annexed … to the conventions signed by Member countries …"

- "… can … be of great assistance in the application and interpretation …"
PRACTICAL OBSERVATIONS

- OECD Model Tax Convention and Commentary form the basis for hundreds of tax treaties (hence somewhat difficult to disregard)
- Often the only material available to shed light on meaning
- Can help develop a common body of international tax law
- Can help avoiding double taxation and double non-taxation
- Gives a degree of certainty for taxpayers
PRACTICAL OBSERVATIONS

**Conditions for relying on commentary**

- Same wording (or meaning) of treaty and OECD Model Tax Convention
- No observations by States in question
- Statement in commentary clear enough
- Other factors must not indicate that another meaning was intended
HOW DO MODEL TAX TREATIES WORK?

- Model treaties contain classification and assignment rules (collectively known as distributive rules) for income subject to tax under domestic tax laws of both countries.

- Distributive rules contain more than fourteen categories of income to cover entire tax base; standard articles may be amended by negotiation.

- Model treaties distinguish income under each article and specify which State has the right to tax.
HOW DO MODEL TAX TREATIES WORK?

- Either Source State or Residence State get exclusive or limited right to tax.
- If states share taxing rights they share cost of eliminating double taxation.
- Model treaties allocate taxing rights but do not make tax rules.
STRUCTURE OF A TAX TREATY
STRUCTURE OF A TAX TREATY

SCOPE PROVISIONS
1. Article 1 - Personal Scope
2. Article 2 - Taxes covered
3. Article 30 - Entry into force
4. Article 31 - Termination

ELIMINATION OF DOUBLE TAXATION
1. Article 23 - Elimination of double taxation
2. Article 25 - Mutual Agreement

DEFINITION PROVISIONS
1. Article 3 - General definitions
2. Article 4 - Residence
3. Article 5 - Permanent Establishment

MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS
1. Article 24 - Non-discrimination
2. Article 28 - Diplomats
3. Article 29 - Territorial Extension

ANTI-AVOIDANCE
1. Article 9 - Associated Enterprise
2. Article 26 - Exchange of Information
3. Article 27 - Assistance in collection of taxes

SUBSTANTIVE PROVISIONS
1. Article 6 - Immovable property
2. Article 7 - Business Profits
3. Article 8 - Shipping
4. Article 10 - Dividends
5. Article 11 - Interest
6. Article 12 - Royalties & FTS
7. Article 13 - Capital gains
8. Article 14 - Independent Personal Services
9. Article 15 - Dependent Personal Services
10. Article 16 - Directors
11. Article 17 - Artistes & Sports persons
12. Article 18 - Pensions
13. Article 19 - Government service
14. Article 20 - Students
15. Article 21 - Other income
16. Article 22 - Capital
INTERPRETATION OF TAX TREATIES
INTERPRETATION OF TAX TREATIES

- The VCLT was codified in 1969 and entered into force in 1980
- Limited scope
- Applicable to both past and future treaties
- Due weightage is given by non signatories and its rules are referred to in growing number of decisions in international courts
- Article 3(2) is a rule on interpretation
  - Undefined terms to be given meaning under domestic law unless ‘context otherwise requires’
INTERPRETATION OF TAX TREATIES

Static vs dynamic interpretation

- Static interpretation: reference in tax treaties refers to legal situation at the moment of conclusion of treaty

- Dynamic interpretation: reference in tax treaties refers to legal situation when treaty is applied

- OECD Commentary: dynamic interpretation unless difference in substance (Introduction, para 35)
AIDS TO INTERPRETATION

- OECD /UN model conventions and commentary
- Protocols
- Technical memorandum
- Parallel treaties
- International case laws
PERSONAL SCOPE OF TAX TREATIES

Who is covered by a tax treaty?

- Article 1
  This convention shall apply to persons who are residents of one or both the contracting states

- Article 3
  Person includes an individual, a company and any other body of persons

- Article 4 - Resident
  Person taxable “by reason of his domicile, residence, place of incorporation…”

TAXAND
**TERRITORIAL SCOPE OF TAX TREATIES**

- Provided in Article 3 - required for application of tax treaty

- Generally ‘Country X’ is defined to mean territory of Country X and includes territorial sea and air space above it, as well as any other maritime zone in which Country X has sovereign rights, other rights and jurisdictions, according to the law of Country X and in accordance with international law

- In most treaties, there will be a territorial scope
TAXES COVERED BY TAX TREATIES

- Article 2 – Income and Capital taxes (usually listed specifically in paragraph 3)

- Interpretative issues
  - What is income or capital tax?
  - Can a tax based on estimated income qualify?
  - Taxes levied by political subdivisions covered?
  - Many states do not accept, partly for constitutional reasons

- Future ‘identical or substantially similar’ taxes covered
SPECIFIC TAXES COVERED BY TAX TREATIES

- There are some taxes which are specifically mentioned in Article 2 and hence get covered

- Australia – New Zealand treaty
  - resource rent tax in respect of offshore projects relating to exploration for or exploitation of petroleum resources and
  - the fringe benefits tax imposed under the Federal Laws of Australia
SPECIFIC TAXES COVERED BY TAX TREATIES

- India – Denmark treaty
  - the seamen’s tax, the church tax and the hydrocarbon tax

- Malaysia – Canada treaty
  - tin profit tax, development tax, timber profits tax and petroleum income tax
ALLOCATION OF TAXING RIGHTS

- Income and capital can be classified into 3 classes:
  - Full taxing rights to source state
  - Limited taxing rights to source state
  - No taxing rights to source state

- As a rule, exclusive right to tax conferred on State of residence

- Generally State of Residence has taxing rights on all incomes

- However, where State of Source given full / limited rights, State of residence to provide relief to avoid double taxation either by exemption method or by credit method
APPLYING A TAX TREATY
CHECK – LIST

🔹 Check residence and ensure that you are using the right treaty

🔹 Latest version? - check if in effect /not terminated? – e.g. tax treaties with East Germany – non existent now – use West German treaty

🔹 How would you know if a treaty has been amended ?
  • Check if there is a Protocol /exchange of notes, etc.

🔹 Treaty languages - Take note of whether the version used is an official /unofficial translation

🔹 Are you dealing with a provision of law introduced after treaty came into effect? What is the treaty impact on this?
SCENARIO

Investor

Deposit

Interest

Bank

Singapore

Indonesia
THE FIVE - STEP APPROACH

Step 1

A tax treaty generally only applies if the taxpayer who is resident in one country receives income from sources from another country.

For example, a Singapore resident receives interest income from an Indonesian bank account.
THE FIVE - STEP APPROACH

Step 2

It has to be checked whether the taxpayer is covered by the treaty. Usually he has to be a resident of one or both of the treaty countries. The term 'resident' is often specifically defined in one of the articles of the treaty (Article 4 of the OECD Model)

For example, is the taxpayer a Singapore resident under the treaty?
THE FIVE-STEP APPROACH

Step 3

Next, the type of income which the taxpayer receives must be determined. The relevant article will determine which country has the right to tax the income. Articles 6 to 22 cover the allocation of the right to tax income.

For example, the article on interest income determines that the right of taxation is allocated to the country of residence, which is Singapore. However, the source country Indonesia is entitled to levy a withholding tax.
THE FIVE - STEP APPROACH

Step 4

If the allocation article provides that the country of source has the right to tax the income, this does not mean that the country of residence may not tax the income. Article 23 of the OECD Model determines how double taxation is avoided in the country of residence: (i) either the country of residence grants a tax credit for the taxes paid in the country of source; (ii) or it exempts the foreign source income from tax.

For example, on interest income taxed in Indonesia, Singapore would grant a tax credit.
THE FIVE-STEP APPROACH

Step 5

Although it maybe clear what happens under the articles of the tax treaty. However, this does not necessarily mean that the respective country actually levies tax on this income. National law must be examined to see if and how the income is taxed.

For example, Indonesia may establish an exemption on all interest income under its domestic law and such exemption will apply irrespective of the allocation of the taxing right under the treaty.
Evolving Treaty Landscape
BEPS ACTION PLAN 15

- BEPS Action Plan 15 deals with development of a Multilateral Instrument (MLI) to implement tax treaty related BEPS measures *inter-alia* including:
  - Action 2 – Neutralizing the effects of hybrid mismatch arrangements
  - Action 6 – Prevention of treaty abuse
  - Action 7 – Preventing the artificial avoidance of permanent establishment status
  - Action 14 – Improving Dispute Resolution

- MLI to modify more than 3000 existing bilateral tax treaties to enable countries to meet treaty-related minimum common standards agreed as a part of BEPS initiative
OECD released text of the MLI and accompanying Explanatory Statement in November 2016

First joint signing ceremony held in Paris on June 7, 2017

88 countries have come forth to sign the MLI as on 18 June 2019 – India and China are first

6 countries have expressed their intent to sign the MLI
ABOUT TAXAND

Taxand is the world’s largest independent tax organisation with more than 400 tax partners and over 2,000 tax advisors in over 40 countries. Taxand focuses on delivering high quality, integrated tax advice, free from conflict creating audit work. Taxand advisors work together to deliver global tax services for clients.

Taxand is a global organisation of tax advisory firms. Each firm in each country is a separate and independent legal entity responsible for delivering client services.

© Copyright Taxand Economic Interest Grouping 2017
Registered office: 1B Heienhaff, L-1736 Senningerberg – RCS Luxembourg C68

www.taxand.com